

PORT OF LOS ANGELES COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE
AIR QUALITY SUBCOMMITTEE
Port of Los Angeles
425 S. Palos Verdes Street
San Pedro, California

Minutes
March 5, 2008

ATTENDEES

COMMITTEE / PCAC

Richard Havenick, Chair
Michele Grubbs, Voting Member
Chuck Hart, Voting Member
Henry Hogo, AdHoc Member
Jody James, Alternate Member
Dr. John Miller, Voting Member
Philip Nicolay, Alternate Member

PORT STAFF

Christopher Patton
Lisa Wunder

PUBLIC PARTICIPANTS

Butterfield Communications, Gwen B.
Edward Kim, SCAQMD/Phone
Sharon Rubulcava, PAAP
David Wright, PAAP

CONSULTANTS

Professor Ed Avol
David Howekamp – Conference Call

LOCATION OF MEETING: POLA Charter High School, 250 W. 5th St., San Pedro, CA

- A. Call To Order: 4:40P.M.
- B. Sign In/Introductions
- C. Agenda Approved
- D. Minutes Approved for the February 6, 2008 AQ Subcommittee Meeting
- E. Public Comment:
Edward Kim, from South Coast Air Quality Management District (AQMD) announced some dates for the MATES III Public Workshops:
Thursday, March 6, 2008, at 6:30PM, at the Carson Community Center, Community Hall C, 801 East Carson Street, Carson, CA 90745, Monday, March 10, 2008, at 6:30PM, at the Crowne Plaza/LA Harbor Hotel, Salon A-B, 601 South Palos Verdes Street, San Pedro, CA 90731, and Wednesday, March 12, 2008, at 6:30PM, at St. Lucy's Church, Joseph Hall, 2344 Cota Avenue, Long Beach, CA 90810.

Christopher Patton reported that both MATES II and MATES III conducted monitoring and modeling and then cross compared the results. The Port of LA will soon be in the position to do the same thing on a more discrete/geographic specific

scale. We are also in the midst of doing a health risk assessment study, which would be for both a baseline year and future year giving us the opportunity to compare the modeling output using state of the art modeling tools to our monitoring data. The Port is currently working with AQMD staff to understand some discrepancies between monitored and modeled data in the MATES III Study.

The health risk assessment study will provide the basis for establishment of Bay-wide Standards. It is our intention to have these standards vetted through the agencies and submitted to the Board by the end of the second quarter 2008.

F. POLA Updates (Including Status of TraPac EIR and Appeal)

- The Port of Los Angeles is looking to adopt the final implementing component of the Clean Truck Program in March.
- The Port of LA and LB have been working with the Shipping Industry to identify alternative ways to achieve the goals of the Ocean Going Vessel Measures. Staff hopes to go to the Board in March with a recommendation regarding OGV4 (Main Engine Emission Reduction Measure/use of Low Sulfur Fuels.)

Michele Grubbs, from Pacific Maritime Shipping Association (PMSA) stated that PMSA supports the measure; however, there are enormous technical issues to overcome. PMSA has had one meeting thus far with a technical committee to discuss and identify viable options. PMSA recently won the lawsuit on CARB's Auxiliary Engine rule in the District Court, as well as the appeal to the Ninth Circuit. However, the PMSA Board has recommended to the membership that they continue to comply with the CARB rule (i.e., burn .5% LSF in auxiliary engines at 24 nautical miles).

Christopher Patton stated that the Port was working to put the finishing touches on the updated revision to the July 2005 Evaluation of Low Sulfur Marine Fuel Availability Study. Fuel availability has improved; however, there are still areas where the demand cannot meet 100% compliance. But that will change in time.

Other opportunities with regard to ocean going vessels are retrofits for auxiliary and main engines for further PM and NOx control or architecting new technologies into newly built vessels. Both are addressed in the CAAP under OGV5. Our focus will be on technology advancement for all source categories as the year progresses.

- No Update on TraPac

G. POLA Presentation on Air Quality Monitoring Program and Measurements Reported to Date

Lisa Wunder, from Environmental Management, provided a presentation and an explanation of the data on the Port of LA real-time air quality monitoring website. There are two websites. The first is a joint San Pedro Bay Ports (Port of LA, Port of

Long Beach) Clean Air Action Plan Website (<http://cleanairactionplan.org>). The second site is <http://portoflosangeles.org>. Links to the real-time monitoring data: Environment Tab, Air Quality Monitoring, and Real-Time Air Monitoring Data.

Both the Port of LA and Long Beach operate an air quality monitoring network, collecting continuous data on ambient air quality and meteorological conditions in the San Pedro Bay region.

The POLB's monitoring stations are strategically located at the Inner Harbor area, near West Long Beach, and the Outer Harbor area on the Navy Mole. The Port of LAs' stations are located (a) in the Outer Harbor, Berth 47, (b) the Terminal Island Treatment Plant, (c) in San Pedro, near the intersection of S. Harbor Boulevard and 3rd Street, and (d) in Wilmington at Saints Peter & Paul Elementary School. Monitoring stations collect real-time measurements for various air pollutants including ozone, carbon monoxide, sulfur dioxide, nitrogen dioxide, and particulate matter, as well as other environmental data that can be used for different environmental studies. The real-time data can be viewed in several formats; Map View that displays the locations of the stations in the Port, the Current Data which presents real-time air quality information, Yesterday's Data that offers a summary of the previous day's air quality and weather data, Daily Highs which shows maximum levels by calendar day, Historical Data which contains air quality data for past days, weeks and months, and Reports that summarize the collected data. The Committee suggested that a glossary be included and that historical data be included for all four sites on the website. POLA will return with some mock-ups.

The state of California and the federal government have established ambient air quality standards for PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5} that define the maximum level of particulates in the air without threatening public health. Additional information can be obtained on the website. Historical data that is not real-time data can also be obtained on the website.

- H. Air Quality Subcommittee Roles/Opportunities Related to Consultant Contracts
Richard Havenick, Dave Howekamp and Ed Avol met with Dr. Appy to discuss consultant contracts. In response to this meeting Mr. Havenick submitted the following (draft) document to Dr. Appy.

Ralph,

As we discussed last week, the text pasted below is suggested to move us forward with the Air Quality Subcommittee and with the contracts with the consultants to the Subcommittee.

I'll appreciate your reviewing the text and suggesting any changes before we might submit the document formally to you.

Thank you for your time with us last week and for considering the suggestions below.

Best regards,
Richard Havenick

I look forward to a continuing dialogue with the Port of Los Angeles regarding Air Quality Issues and suggest that the continuation of the Air Quality Subcommittee offers the Port several important benefits including the following:

1. A public venue to increase awareness of POLA environmental efforts.
2. An opportunity for respectful and productive dialogue between and among representatives from industry, labor, ports, and the public.
3. A regular forum for POLA to obtain informal public input.
4. An opportunity for the public to communicate concerns to POLA that otherwise would consume Board of Harbor Commissioners meeting time.

I acknowledge that organizations should evolve to meet changing circumstances, and I suggest that the following changes be proposed at the March Subcommittee meeting:

1. Outreach by the Subcommittee will be suggested via personal contacts, newsletters, neighborhood association meetings, etc. to expand and diversify community participation.
2. Meeting agendas will be coordinated with Port staff and will consist of one or two items with one headline item specifically regarding POLA environmental efforts, such as the following: Air Quality Monitoring Program; Health Risk Assessment; Emissions Inventory; Technology Advancement Program; Clean Air Action Plan update for 2008.
3. Meetings will be scheduled for every other month to avoid participant burnout and allow adequate time for preparation of in-depth topic presentations.
4. Discussion at future meetings will be focused on the advisory role of the subcommittee in order to identify how the community members and port staff can work together to promote mutual public health goals.

I ask that you consider the important and constructive role the two Air Quality subcommittee consultants have played in providing technical, credible, and pertinent information and recommendations to both the public and POLA staff, as proven in prior years in no less than the following critically important activities:

- Technical assistance to POLA and Ports Technical Working Groups regarding Air Quality Monitoring Program, Health Risk Assessment, Emissions Inventory, emerging technologies and operational methodologies, and evaluation of mitigation measures.
- Liaison with the public in communicating technical details regarding air quality and mitigation methods and in offering third-party perspectives, often resulting in enhanced credibility for POLA.
- Participation in the Technical Advisory Committee discussions on implementation of the Air Quality Mitigation Program.

In hopes that our beneficial working relationship will continue, I request that the following changes be implemented:

1. Ensure contracts are established with the consultants to permit active participation and support for periods longer than a few months at a time.
2. Include the AQ consultants as observers/participants (as in prior years) in deliberations of the CAAP Technical Working Group meetings, mailings, and deliberations

The Port and the public are best served through developing and maintaining an open line of communication to avoid unnecessary misunderstandings, controversy, and confrontation. I believe the AQ subcommittee has been and should continue to be a valuable bridge for communication and progress. Success for the Port and the public is more certain if we utilize the venue for open communication the subcommittee offers amidst the wide range of air quality, public health, and cargo-movement related issues before us. A reinvented AQ Subcommittee as described above offers a uniquely constructive avenue for enhancing our mutual ability to address air quality issues.

I look forward to your response and any changes you might suggest that may enhance the subcommittee approach.

The Committee will need to approve any significant changes in how we operate. In the meantime, Dr. Appy will provide feedback. This issue will be discussed further at the April meeting.

- I. Items for Future Meetings (e.g., Health Risk Assessment, Future Big Reduction Opportunities, Questions Regarding Relationship between CAAP, Growth, and EIR Projects)
- J. Adjournment: 6:30PM

Signature on File
Richard Havenick, Chair
Air Quality Subcommittee

Signature on File
Debra Babcock-Doherty, PCAC Executive Assistant